# Genetic and morphological data support placement of Myrmotherula gularis (Spix) in the monotypic genus Rhopias Cabanis and Heine (Aves: Passeriformes: Thamnophilidae) 

RICARDO BELMONTE-LOPES ${ }^{1,2,7}$; GUSTAVO A. BRAVO ${ }^{3}$, MARCOS R. BORNSCHEIN ${ }^{1,4}$; GIOVANNI N. MAURÍCIO ${ }^{5,6}$, MARCIO R. PIE ${ }^{1}$ \& ROBB T. BRUMFIELD ${ }^{3}$<br>${ }^{1}$ Laboratório de Dinâmica Evolutiva e Sistemas Complexos, Departamento de Zoologia, Universidade Federal do Paraná, Centro Politécnico, Jardim das Américas, Caixa Postal 19020, CEP 81531-990, Curitiba, Paraná, Brazil;<br>${ }^{2}$ Programa de Pós-Graduação em Zoologia, Departamento de Zoologia, Universidade Federal do Paraná, Centro Politécnico, Jardim das Américas, Caixa Postal 19020, CEP 81531-990, Curitiba, Paraná, Brazil;<br>${ }^{3}$ Museum of Natural Science and Department of Biological Sciences, Louisiana State University, Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70803, USA;<br>${ }^{4}$ Programa de Pós-Graduação em Ecologia e Conservação, Universidade Federal do Paraná, Centro Politécnico, Jardim das Américas, CEP 81531-990, Curitiba, Paraná, Brazil;<br>${ }^{5}$ Grupo Especial de Estudo e Proteção do Ambiente Aquático do Rio Grande do Sul, Rua Tiradentes, 2247, CEP 96010-165, Pelotas, Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil;<br>${ }^{6}$ Laboratório de Aves Aquáticas, Instituto de Ciências Biológicas, Campus Carreiros, Universidade Federal do Rio Grande (FURG), Caixa Postal 474, CEP 96201-900, Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil.<br>${ }^{7}$ E-mail: rbelmonte.lopes@gmail.com


#### Abstract

Recent DNA-based phylogenetic analyses of the family Thamnophilidae have shown that the genus Myrmotherula is polyphyletic. Traditional plumage-based taxonomy has been misleading in terms of identifying independently evolving lineages within the complex. Here, we integrate a molecular phylogeny with morphometric information and ancestral reconstruction of syringeal character states of the Musculi vocales ventrales, to investigate the taxonomic position of $M$. gularis, a species for which phylogenetic affinities have long been uncertain. We show that M. gularis represents a long branch in the tribe Thamnophilini that is not closely related to any other member of the Myrmotherula complex. Its relationships within the tribe remain uncertain because of the lack of phylogenetic resolution at the base of the tribe. $M$. gularis shares a derived character state of the M. vocalis ventralis with Taraba, Hypoedaleus, and Mackenziaena, which supports a close relationship between M. gularis and the large antshrikes. M. gularis can be diagnosed from Myrmotherula and Epinecrophylla by this condition of its M. vocalis ventralis, and from Isleria by plumage and other morphological traits. The phylogenetic and morphological distinctiveness of M. gularis does not warrant merging it into any other genus. We propose that this species be placed in a monotypic genus, for which the available name Rhopias applies.


Key words: Antwren, Musculus vocalis ventralis, phylogeny, syrinx, Atlantic Forest

## Introduction

The genus Myrmotherula Sclater, 1858, as traditionally recognized, was one of the most species-rich avian genera in the New World (Meyer de Schauensee, 1966; Sibley \& Monroe, 1990; Zimmer \& Isler, 2003). The traditional plumage-based taxonomy of the genus was considered problematic by earlier authors (i.e., Cory \& Hellmayr, 1924; Peters, 1951), and several subsequent studies indicated that Myrmotherula is polyphyletic (Hackett \& Rosenberg, 1990; Gonzaga, 2001; Irestedt et al., 2004; Brumfield et al., 2007; Bravo et al., 2012). Recently, the genus Epinecrophylla Isler and Brumfield, 2006 (Isler et al., 2006) was described for eight species referred to as the "stipple-throated" antwrens, and the genus Isleria Bravo, Chesser and Brumfield, 2012 was erected for M. hauxwelli Sclater and M. guttata Vieillot.

Despite the description of these two new genera, taxonomic problems in the Myrmotherula complex (sensu Zimmer \& Isler, 2003) remain. The phylogenetic position of M. gularis (Spix, 1825) is unclear, but earlier analyses
of plumage, morphometrics, vocalizations and syringeal anatomy (Gonzaga, 2001), and DNA-based phylogenetic reconstructions (Isler et al., 2006; Bravo et al., 2012) suggest that it is not closely related to Myrmotherula, Epinecrophylla or Isleria.

Here, we evaluate the generic status of $M$. gularis by integrating a subset of a comprehensive molecular phylogeny of the Thamnophilidae (Bravo et al., unpubl. data) with analyses of morphometric data and ancestral reconstruction of states of the Musculus vocalis ventralis, a feature of syringeal morphology previously used in phylogenetic inference in the family (Gonzaga, 2001).

## Methods

Molecular analyses. We used a subset of a densely sampled molecular phylogeny of the Thamnophilidae (only six of the 224 species are missing) (Bravo et al., unpubl. data) to evaluate the phylogenetic placement of M. gularis. We used sequences of three mitochondrial genes (cytochrome b-cytb, 1,045 bp; NADH dehydrogenase subunit 2 -ND2, 1,041 bp; and NADH dehydrogenase subunit 3-ND3, 351 bp ), one autosomal nuclear intron (b-fibrinogen intron 5— $\beta \mathrm{F} 5$; 568 bp ), and two coding nuclear genes (recombination activation gene 1 -RAG1, 2,872 bp; recombination activation gene $2-\mathrm{RAG} 2,1,152 \mathrm{bp}$ ). Taxon sampling (Table 1) for this subset includes 57 individuals representing 52 species and 30 genera ( $23 \%$ and $59 \%$ of the family, respectively), and included samples of Myrmotherula brachyura Hermann (2 individuals), M. axillaris Vieillot (2), M. gularis (4), Epinecrophylla haematonota Sclater (1), E. erythrura Sclater (1) and Isleria hauxwelli (1). Note that the type species of Myrmotherula is Muscicapa pygmaea Gmelin, a synonym of Myrmotherula brachyura, a taxon represented in our sampling (see above). The samples from M. gularis covered the extremes of its distribution. The phylogeny was outgroup-rooted using sequences of nine species of non-thamnophilid suboscines: Pipra spp. Linnaeus (Pipridae; LSUMZ B-18078/AMNH DOT-3872), Furnarius rufus (Gmelin) (Furnariidae; AMNH DOT-10431), Chamaeza campanisona (Lichtenstein) (Formicariidae; UWBM KGB14), Liosceles thoracicus (Sclater) (Rhinocryptidae; FMNH 390080), Hylopezus berlepschi (Hellmayr) (Grallariidae; FMNH 322345), Pittasoma spp. Cassin (Conopophagidae; LSUMZ B-2285/B-11863), and Melanopareia elegans (Lesson) (Melanopareiidae; LSUMZ B5245/5246).

Total DNA was extracted from 25 mg of pectoral muscle using the Qiagen DNeasy kit following the manufacturer's protocol, and polymerase chain reactions were performed using the protocols of Brumfield et al. (2007) for cytb, ND2, ND3, and $\beta$ F5, and of Groth and Barrowclough (1999) and Barker et al. (2002) for RAG-1 and RAG-2. Each gene region was bidirectionally sequenced to verify accuracy. Additional sequences from our previous work (Brumfield \& Edwards, 2007; Brumfield et al., 2007; Moyle et al., 2009; Gómez et al., 2010; Bravo et al., 2012) that were available on GenBank were also used.

Analyses were conducted using a concatenated six-gene $7,029 \mathrm{bp}$ alignment produced in the program MAFFT v. 6 (Katoh et al., 2002). To avoid phylogeny over-parameterization, we ran ML analyses for six different partition schemes under the GTR+G model of nucleotide substitution using RAxML 7.2 .7 (Stamatakis, 2006) on the Cipres Science Gateway V 3.1 (Miller et al., 2010). We used the obtained likelihood values to calculate the Akaike Information Criterion (AIC) (Akaike, 1974) for each partition and established that the most informative partition scheme was the one with 16 partitions (the nuclear intron and each codon position for each coding gene are treated separately). Using this partitioning scheme, we estimated the phylogeny via maximum likelihood using RAxML and assessed nodal confidence by performing 1,000 bootstrap replicates.

We conducted a Bayesian analysis using MrBayes 3.1.2 (Huelsenbeck \& Ronquist, 2001) on the University of Oslo Bioportal (Kumar et al., 2009). For each partition we evaluated 24 finite-sites substitution models with MrModeltest 2.3 (Nylander, 2004) based on likelihood scores from PAUP* (Swofford, 2003). We identified the best substitution model via comparison of AIC values. We performed our analysis with four runs and four MCMC chains, using 20,000,000 generations with a sample frequency of 1,000 , a chain temperature of 1.75 , and a burn-in of $20 \%$. The results of the Bayesian inference were analyzed for convergence using the compare splits and the slide window analyses implemented at AWTY (Wilgenbusch et al., 2004; Nylander et al., 2008). Both approaches demonstrated that the chains reached convergence adequately.

Morphological analyses. To examine the position of M. gularis in the morphometric space occupied by the Thamnophilini (sensu Moyle et al., 2009), we performed a principal components analysis (PCA) on log-
transformed morphometric measurements of tail, wing, and tarsus using R v2.13 (R Development Core Team, 2011). A total of 96 specimens was measured, including at least four individuals of each species (except for Frederickena fulva, $\mathrm{n}=3$ ) included in the phylogenetic analyses (Appendix 1). To capture variation in both size and shape across species, measurements were not corrected for body size or weight.

We also examined the syringeal morphology of 65 species of Thamnophilidae from 28 genera (total of 88 specimens) (Appendix 2) because it has been shown to be a phylogenetically informative trait in suboscines (e.g. Ames, 1971; Prum, 1990; Galvão \& Gonzaga, 2011). Specifically, we examined the pair of Musculi vocales ventrales (Mm. v. ventrales) of each species for the presence or absence of two previously described character states (Gonzaga, 2001). In one state the cranial ends of the Mm. v. ventrales meet at the ventral surface of the syrinx, forming a continuous arch. In the other, a large gap separates its cranial ends, with each muscle being, or tending to be, restricted to the ventrolateral surface of the syrinx (Fig. 1). Syringes were obtained from dissected study specimens, stained with iodine, and analyzed in stereoscopic microscopes using the 20-60X objectives. Because syringeal material of $E$. haematonota was unavailable, we examined material of its close relative $E$. spodionota (Sclater \& Salvin), and used the observed state as representative of the genus Epinecrophylla in the ancestral state reconstructions. Additional data were obtained from Bornschein et al. (1995) and Gonzaga (2001). Because syringeal data were unavailable for some species included in the phylogenetic analyses, we used a smaller subset of species to reconstruct ancestral character states of the Mm. v. ventralis in the Thamnophilidae. Ancestral character states were reconstructed using unordered parsimony and maximum-likelihood under an Mk1 model (Lewis, 2001) in Mesquite 2.75 (Madison \& Madison, 2011). We used the default settings of Mesquite to allow states to be parsimoniously placed at each node (most parsimonious reconstructions set; see Swofford \& Maddison, 1987; Maddison \& Maddison, 2000) instead of attempting to resolve ambiguous nodes via optimization criteria.


FIGURE 1. Different conditions of the Musculus vocalis ventralis (MVV) found in the Thamnophilidae. A. Cranial ends of the Mm. v. ventrales separated by a large gap on the ventral side of the syrinx in Myrmotherula axillaris (MCP 3134); this morphology was found in other Myrmotherula species examined, as well as in Epinecrophylla and other taxa (see Fig. 5 and Appendix 2). B. Cranial ends of the Mm. v. ventrales meet on the ventral side of the syrinx of Myrmotherula gularis (MCP 1724), forming an arch; this morphology was found in Isleria and several other taxa (see Fig. 5 and Appendix 2).

## Results

Molecular analyses. The maximum likelihood and Bayesian analyses (Figs. 2 and 3) confirmed that M. gularis is not a close relative of Myrmotherula, Epinecrophylla, or Isleria. As previously suggested, Myrmotherula belongs in the tribe Formicivorini (sensu Moyle et al., 2009), Epinecrophylla in the tribe Microrhopiini (Moyle et al., 2009), and Isleria and M. gularis in the tribe Thamnophilini (Bravo et al., 2012). M. gularis represents a highly distinctive lineage with relatively low intraspecific variation, but some genetic structure. The phylogenetic position of M. gularis within the Thamnophilini remains unresolved. Myrmotherula gularis, Dichrozona cincta (Pelzeln), and Megastictus margaritatus (Sclater) represent genetically distinctive lineages with long branches and poorly supported phylogenetic positions. With very low support, both methods of phylogenetic analysis suggest that $M$. gularis might be sister to a clade containing the large antshrikes in the genera Cymbilaimus Gray, Batara Lesson, Taraba Lesson, Hypoedaleus Cabanis and Heine, Mackenziaena Chubb, and Frederickena Chubb. Results of the Bayesian analysis (Fig. 3) suggest, with low support, that M. gularis might also be sister to Dichrozona Ridgway, but this could be an artifact of long-branch attraction.

Morphological analysis. The PCA analysis of morphometric measurements of genera in the Thamnophilini (Fig. 4) showed that the overall body structure of M. gularis is distinctive within the tribe. PC1 reflected overall size variation associated primarily with tail length, and explained $91.8 \%$ of the variance. Differences in PC2 and PC3 scores had low explanatory power and are not discussed further.

The condition of the Mm. v. ventrales in M. gularis corresponds to the character state in which the muscles meet in the ventral surface of the syrinx, forming a continuous arch (Fig. 1B; Appendix 2). This character state was found in all tribes except for Formicivorini, which contains the genera Myrmotherula and Formicivora Swainson. The character state in which the cranial ends of the Mm. v. ventrales are separated by a large gap (Fig. 1A) is widely distributed in the analyzed subset of the Thamnophilidae.

The ancestral reconstruction of morphological states of the M. vocalis ventralis was not entirely congruent between parsimony and ML methods. The parsimony reconstruction on the Bayesian topology was mostly equivocal, whereas the ML reconstruction on the Bayesian topology was congruent with results of both methods on the ML topology. All reconstructions were congruent regarding the character condition in the ancestor of the Myrmotherula type-species clade. Therefore, we only present results based on the ML topology (Fig. 5). Bayesian reconstructions are available upon request.

Both reconstructions under the ML topology recovered the condition in which the cranial ends of the Mm. v. ventrales are separated by a large gap as the most likely plesiomorphic condition in the family. The condition in which the Mm. v. ventrales forms a continuous arch is homoplastic, having evolved at least five times independently. Reconstructions by unordered parsimony and maximum likelihood produced concordant results regarding the ancestral state of Mm. v. ventrales in the tribe Formicivorini (Fig. 1A, Fig. 5). Myrmotherula species exhibited a Mm. v. ventrales separated by a large gap (Fig. 1A) and differed from the observed character state in $M$. gularis (Fig. 1B).

## Discussion

Molecular and morphological analyses showed that M. gularis is not a close relative of other Myrmotherula (including the assemblage that contains the type species), Epinecrophylla, or Isleria, providing support for previous findings that Myrmotherula sensu lato is polyphyletic (Hackett \& Rosenberg, 1990; Gonzaga, 2001; Irestedt et al., 2004; Isler et al., 2006; Brumfield et al., 2007; Gomez et al., 2010; Bravo et al., 2012). Because the closest relatives of M. gularis remain uncertain, merging this taxon with any other genus would potentially violate the principle of monophyly. Given the high levels of ecological and phenotypic divergence between M. gularis and its putative closest relatives, it would also create an exceptionally heterogeneous taxon (see below). Therefore, we consider that $M$. gularis must be placed in a monotypic genus. The following name has priority (see Cory \& Hellmayr, 1924) and is resurrected for this taxon:


FIGURE 2. Maximum-likelihood phylogeny of a subset of the Thamnophilidae showing that M. gularis is not closely related to Myrmotherula, Epinecrophylla, or Isleria. Numbers at each node indicate bootstrap support based on 1000 maximum likelihood replicates.

Rhopias Cabanis and Heine, 1859-1860
Type-species: Thamnophilus gularis Spix, 1825
Type-locality: Rio de Janeiro (designated by Cory \& Hellmayr, 1924)


FIGURE 3. $50 \%$ Majority-rule Bayesian consensus tree of a subset of the Thamnophilidae showing that M. gularis is not closely related to Myrmotherula, Epinecrophylla, or Isleria. Numbers at each node indicate posterior probability values.

## Included species: Rhopias gularis (Spix, 1825)

Diagnosis: Small thamnophilid, member of the tribe Thamnophilini (sensu Moyle et al. 2009) as indicated by phylogenetic inference based on molecular data. Measures $8.5-9.5 \mathrm{~cm}$ and weighs $10-13 \mathrm{~g}$, with short tail ( $51.8 \%$
of wing length) and relatively long tarsi ( $38.1 \%$ of wing length). Rhopias has a tracheophone syrinx, with the cranial ends of the Mm. v. ventrales meeting in the ventral surface of the syrinx and forming a continuous arch. This condition of the $M$. vocalis ventralis diagnoses the genus from all species currently placed in Myrmotherula and other species in the tribe Formicivorini, all of which have the cranial ends of the Mm. v. ventrales separated by a large gap on the ventral side of the syrinx. Rhopias can be diagnosed from the clade of the large antshrikes and the other genera in the Thamnophilini (except for Dichrozona and Isleria) by its shorter tail and longer tarsi in relation to wing length. Rhopias can be diagnosed from Isleria by its relatively longer tail ( $45.5 \%$ of wing length in Isleria), and from Dichrozona by its smaller wings, relatively longer tail ( $41 \%$ of wing length in Dichrozona), and by its condition of the M. vocalis ventralis.


FIGURE 4. PCA analysis of wing, tail, and tarsus length for the genera of the tribe Thamnophilini.
Rhopias gularis, the only species of the genus, has reduced sexual dimorphism: both sexes have gray underparts and rufescent brown upperparts, lower flanks, and crissum. Both sexes present a forehead grizzled with gray, black throat with white spots (spots larger in the female), wing-coverts blackish with buff tips forming two wing-bars, and a white (males) or a buff (females) patch on the leading edge of the wing at the wrist. Rhopias differs from the clade containing M. brachyura (streaked antwren assemblage), the clade containing M. axillaris (grey antwren assemblage), and the clade containing M. unicolor (plain-winged Myrmotherula group) (sensu Zimmer \& Isler, 2003) by having a stippled black-throat with unstreaked brown and grey plumage instead of streaked, mostly grey, or plain-winged plumage pattern, and also by a smaller bill and tail (see Cory \& Hellmayr,
1924). Rhopias can be diagnosed from Isleria by the absence, in both sexes, of conspicuous white or buff markings on tertiary feathers (Bravo et al., 2012). Plumage features are shared in Rhopias and Epinecrophylla, but Rhopias has a considerably shorter tail, and species in the two genera exhibit consistent ecological differences (Isler et al., 2006; see below). Rhopias can also be diagnosed from Epinecrophylla by its Mm. v. ventrales, which forms a continuous arch rather than being separated by a large gap, and by its dark-colored iris (black or dark brown), which differs from the more light-colored irides found in Epinecrophylla.


FIGURE 5. Reconstructions of character states of the Musculus vocalis ventralis in a reduced subset of the family Thamnophilidae derived from the phylogenetic analyses (see Fig. 2 and 3). A. Unordered parsimony reconstruction, gray color indicates equivocal ancestral states under the most parsimonious reconstructions set. B. Maximum likelihood reconstruction.

Distribution and ecology. Rhopias gularis is endemic to the Atlantic Forest of eastern Brazil, where it occurs from sea level to 1550 m , primarily above 300 m (Zimmer \& Isler, 2003) although in the southernmost Brazilian states the species is common below this altitude (MRB unpub. data). It occurs from the southern coast of the state of Bahia to the northeastern part of the state of Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil; it also extends westward into the state of Paraná (Sick, 1997; Zimmer \& Isler, 2003). It is not sympatric with any species of Epinecrophylla or Isleria.

Rhopias gularis is commonly found in pairs or small family groups. The species favors tangles and dense vegetation, especially shaded ravines in mountainous areas and sluggish streams in the lowlands (Ridgely \& Tudor, 1994; Zimmer \& Isler, 2003). It tends to forage near the ground away from mixed-species flocks, in contrast to many species of Myrmotherula and Epinecrophylla (e.g., Skutch, 1946, 1969; Pearson, 1977; Munn \& Terborgh, 1979; Stotz, 1990; Whitney, 1994; Stotz et al., 1996; Sick, 1997; Develey \& Peres, 2000; Develey \& Stouffer, 2001). The vocal repertoire of Rhopias does not include the song type used in ritualized confrontations of Epinecrophylla (Isler et al., 2006).

The nest of $R$. gularis is briefly described as cup-shaped and is supported from below or placed on a branch fork (Zimmer \& Isler, 2003). It is not clear whether it differs from nests constructed by members of the streakedantwren group (including M. brachyura), which have pouch or deep cup nests (Zimmer \& Isler, 2003; Isler et al., 2006). However, it differs from the nests of Epinecrophylla, which are domed or oven shaped with oblique or side entrances (Sick, 1997; Isler et al., 2006). The nest of R. gularis resembles those of Isleria and those of some members of the gray assemblage (Zimmer \& Isler, 2003), although some species of the latter group apparently construct open cup nests attached at rim (Sick, 1997).

TABLE 1. Ingroup taxa used in this study and their respective tissue collection catalog number. Tissue collections: AMNH—American Museum of Natural History, New York City; FMNH—Field Museum of Natural History, Chicago; KU—The University of Kansas Natural History Museum, Lawrence; LSUMZ—Louisiana State University Museum of Natural Science, Baton Rouge; MCP-Coleção de Ornitologia do Museu de Ciências e Tecnologia da Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio Grande do Sul, Porto Alegre; MZUSP-Museu de Zoologia Universidade de São Paulo, São Paulo; USNM—United States National Museum of Natural History-Smithsonian Institution, Washington; UWBM—University of Washington Burke Museum, Seattle.

| Species | Subspecies | Country and political subregion | Museum | Tissue <br> No. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Cymbilaimus lineatus | intermedius | Bolivia: Santa Cruz | LSUMZ | B-18168 |
| Hypoedaleus guttatus | guttatus | Argentina: Misiones | UWBM | DHB1805 |
| Batara cinerea | argentina | Bolivia: Santa Cruz | UWBM | RTB520 |
| Mackenziaena leachii | monotypic | Argentina: Misiones | USNM | B-5986 |
| Mackenziaena severa | monotypic | Paraguay: Itapúa | KU | 3729 |
| Frederickena viridis | monotypic | Guyana: Barima-Waini | USNM | B-9259 |
| Frederickena fulva | monotypic | Peru: Loreto | LSUMZ | B-4281 |
| Taraba major | melanurus | Peru: Madre de Dios | FMNH | 321773 |
| Thamnophilus doliatus | radiatus | Bolivia: Santa Cruz | UWBM | RTB390 |
| Thamnophilus palliatus | puncticeps | Bolivia: Santa Cruz | UWBM | MAB2 |
| Thamnophilus ambiguus | monotypic | Brazil: Bahia | LSUMZ | B-35569 |
| Thamnophilus caerulescens | caerulescens | Brazil: São Paulo | FMNH | 395426 |
| Thamnophilus ruficapillus | cochabambae | Bolivia: Santa Cruz | UWBM | RTB347 |
| Megastictus margaritatus | monotypic | Peru: Loreto | LSUMZ | B-6836 |
| Neoctantes niger | monotypic | Peru: Cuzco | FMNH | 321806 |
| Dysithamnus mentalis | emiliae | Brazil: Pernambuco | FMNH | 392443 |
| Dysithamnus plumbeus | monotypic | Brazil: Bahia | MZUSP | BA192 |
| Thamnomanes caesius | glaucus | Guyana: Barima-Waini | USNM | B-9482 |
| Epinecrophylla haematonota | haematonota | Peru: Loreto | LSUMZ | B-4579 |
| Epinecrophylla erythrura | septentrionalis | Peru: San Martín | LSUMZ | B-5474 |
| Myrmotherula brachyura | monotypic | Brazil: Amazonas | LSUMZ | B-20305 |
| Myrmotherula brachyura | monotypic | Peru: Loreto | LSUMZ | B-4889 |
| Myrmotherula surinamensis | monotypic | Guyana: Upper Takutu-Upper Essequibo | USNM | B-11838 |
| Isleria hauxwelli | suffusa | Peru: Loreto | LSUMZ | B-4270 |
| Myrmotherula gularis | monotypic | Brazil: São Paulo | LSUMZ | B-16938 |
| Myrmotherula gularis | monotypic | Brazil: São Paulo | FMNH | 330815 |
| Myrmotherula gularis | monotypic | Brazil: Bahia | MCP | 1724 |
| Myrmotherula gularis | monotypic | Brazil: Paraná | MCP | 1726 |
| Myrmotherula axillaris | luctuosa | Brazil: Pernambuco | FMNH | 392444 |
| Myrmotherula axillaris | axillaris | Suriname: Sipaliwini District | LSUMZ | B-55209 |
| Dichrozona cincta | monotypic | Bolivia: La Paz | FMNH | 391144 |
| Herpsilochmus atricapillus | monotypic | Bolivia: Santa Cruz | LSUMZ | B-6632 |
| Herpsilochmus sticturus | monotypic | Guyana: Cuyuni-Mazaruni | USNM | B-5228 |
| Herpsilochmus rufimarginatus | frater | Venezuela: Bolívar | FMNH | 339650 |
| Formicivora grisea | grisea | Bolivia: Santa Cruz | LSUMZ | B-15217 |
| Formicivora serrana | serrana | Brazil: Minas Gerais | MZUSP | 85431 |
| Formicivora melanogaster | melanogaster | Bolivia: Santa Cruz | LSUMZ | B-6675 |
| Formicivora rufa | chapmani | Brazil: Amapá | FMNH | 391399 |
| Drymophila ferruginea | monotypic | Brazil: São Paulo | LSUMZ | B-37217 |
| Drymophila ochropyga | monotypic | Brazil: Rio de Janeiro | LSUMZ | B-37221 |
| Hypocnemis ochrogyna | monotypic | Bolivia: Santa Cruz | LSUMZ | B-15122 |
| Terenura sharpei | monotypic | Bolivia: Cochabamba | LSUMZ | B-39086 |
| Terenura spodioptila | spodioptila | Guyana: Cuyuni-Mazaruni | USNM | B-5113 |
| Cercomacra tyrannina | tyrannina | Panama: Darién | LSUMZ | B-2273 |
| Cercomacra laeta | sabinoi | Brazil: Pernambuco | FMNH | 392376 |
| Cercomacra nigrescens | approximans | Brazil: Rondônia | FMNH | 389848 |
| Pyriglena leucoptera | monotypic | Paraguay: Caaguazú | LSUMZ | B-25922 |
| Hypocnemoides maculicauda | monotypic | Bolivia: Santa Cruz | LSUMZ | B-12660 |
| Sclateria naevia | naevia | Brazil: Amapá | FMNH | 391418 |
| Schistocichla rufifacies | monotypic | Brazil: Rondônia | FMNH | 389929 |
| Myrmeciza squamosa | monotypic | Brazil: São Paulo | LSUMZ | B-16940 |
| Myrmeciza pelzelni | monotypic | Venezuela: Amazonas | LSUMZ | B-7523 |
| Myrmeciza atrothorax | obscurata | Perú: Madre de Dios | FMNH | 322209 |
| Myrmornis torquata | torquata | Brazil: Rondônia | FMNH | 389880 |
| Pithys albifrons | albifrons | Brazil: Amapá | FMNH | 391430 |
| Gymnopithys rufigula | pallidus | Venezuela: Amazonas | LSUMZ | B-7512 |
| Phaenostictus mcleannani | mcleannani | Panama: Darién | LSUMZ | B-2135 |

Phylogenetic affinities. Cabanis and Heine (1859-1860) suggested the inclusion of the species now classified as Epinecrophylla haematonota, E. ornata, Isleria guttata, and I. hauxwelli in the genus Rhopias. None of our results or those from other studies (Isler et al., 2006; Bravo et al., 2012) support the placement of any of these species with Rhopias; despite high degrees of phenotypic similarity, our results showed that these species are not closely related to R. gularis. Although our molecular results show that Rhopias does not belong in the same tribe as Myrmotherula, its placement in the Thamnophilini was unexpected. The shared syrinx morphology between Rhopias and the large thamnophilid antshrikes, as well as other genera such as Herpsilochmus and Dysithamnus, also supports the placement of Rhopias in the tribe. Further studies are needed to unravel the phylogenetic affinities of Rhopias within the Thamnophilini.

## Acknowledgments

We are grateful to the curators and collection managers of the MCP, MZUSP, MPEG, UWBM, USNM, KU, FMNH, and AMNH. N. Aristizábal assisted in obtaining sequences. S. Cardiff and D. Dittmann from the Louisiana State University Museum of Natural Sciences (LSUMZ) assisted in obtaining syrinx material. Fred R. Bornschein helped with German translations and C.A. Ribeiro helped with the syrinx illustrations. RB-L was supported by fellowships from CNPq/MCT (132893/2009-6) and CAPES, and is currently supported by a doctoral fellowship from CNPq/MCT (141823/2011-9). GAB and RTB were supported by grants from the Frank Chapman Memorial Fund - AMNH, the American Ornithologists' Union, the LSUMNS Big Day Fund, LSU Biograds, and NFS grants DEB-0841729 and DEB-1011435. MRB was supported by a doctoral fellowship from REUNI/CAPES and CAPES. MRP was supported by a CNPq/MCT grant (571334/2008-3). Most of the syrinx specimens examined were collected under the Brazilian government SISBio permits 19792-2, 19792-3 and 26227-1. A previous version of this manuscript was improved thanks to valuable comments provided by A.M. Cuervo and J.V. Remsen. This paper was improved thanks to the valuable comments and references provided by R.T. Chesser and two anonymous reviewers.

## References

Akaike, H. (1974) A new look at the statistical model identification. IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control, 19, 716-723. Ames, P.L. (1971) The morphology of the syrinx in passerine birds. Peabody Museum Natural History Bulletin, 37, 1-194.
Barker, F.K., Barrowclough, G.F. \& Groth, J.G. (2002) A phylogenetic hypothesis for passerine birds: taxonomic and biogeographic implications of an analysis of nuclear DNA sequence data. Proceedings of the Royal Society B-Biological Sciences, 269, 295-308.
Bornschein, M.R., Reinert, B.L. \& Teixeira, D.M. (1995) Um novo Formicariidae do Sul do Brasil (Aves, Passeriformes). Série Técnico-Científica do Instituto Iguaçu de Pesquisa e Preservação Ambiental 1, Rio de Janeiro, 18pp.
Bravo, G.A., Chesser, R.T. \& Brumfield, R.T. (2012) Isleria, a new genus of antwren (Aves: Passeriformes: Thamnophilidae). Zootaxa, 3195, 61-67.
Brumfield, R.T. \& Edwards, S.V. (2007) Evolution into and out of the Andes: a Bayesian analysis of historical diversification in Thamnophilus antshrikes. Evolution, 61, 346-367.
Brumfield, R.T., Tello, J.G., Cheviron, Z.A., Carling, M.D., Crochet, N. \& Rosenberg, K.V. (2007) Phylogenetic conservatism and antiquity of a tropical specialization: Army-ant-following in the typical antbirds (Thamnophilidae). Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution, 45, 1-13.
Cabanis, J. \& Heine, F. (1859-1860) Verzeichniss der ornithologischen Sammlung des Oberamtmann Ferdinand Heine auf Gut St. Burchard vor Halberstadt. Mit kritischen Anmerkungen und Beschreinbung der neuen arten systematisch bearbeitet. Museum Heineanum, 2, 1-175.
Cory, C.B. \& Hellmayr, C.E. (1924) Catalogue of the birds of the Americas, part III: Pteroptochidae - Conopophagidae Formicariidae. Field Museum of Natural History Publication Zoological Series, 223(XII), 369pp.
Develey, P.F. \& Peres, C.A. (2000) Resource seasonality and the structure of mixed species bird flocks in a coastal Atlantic Forest of southeastern Brazil. Journal of Tropical Ecology, 16, 33-53.
Develey, P.F. \& Stouffer, P.C. (2001) Effects of roads on movements by understory birds in mixed-species flocks in central Amazonian Brazil. Conservation Biology, 15, 1416-1422.
Galvão, A. \& Gonzaga, L.P. (2011) Morphological support for placement of the Wing-banded Antbird Myrmornis torquata in the Thamnophilidae (Passeriformes: Furnariides). Zootaxa, 3122, 37-67.
Gómez, J.P., Bravo, G.A., Brumfield, R.T., Tello, J.G. \& Cadena, C.D. (2010) A phylogenetic approach to disentangling the role of competition and habitat filtering in community assembly of Neotropical forest birds. Journal of Animal Ecology, 79, 1181-1192.
Gonzaga, L.A.P. (2001) Análise filogenética do gênero Formicivora Swainson, 1825 (Aves: Passeriformes: Thamnophilidae) baseada em caracteres morfológicos e vocais. PhD Dissertation. Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro, Rio de Janeiro, 215 pp .

Groth, J.G. \& Barrowclough, G.F. (1999) Basal divergence in birds and phylogenetic utility of the nuclear RAG-1 gene. Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution, 12, 115-123.
Hackett, S.J. \& Rosenberg, K.V. (1990) Comparison of the phenotypic and genetic differentiation in South American antwrens (Formicariidae). The Auk, 107, 473-489.
Huelsenbeck, J.P. \& Ronquist, F. (2001) MRBAYES: Bayesian inference of phylogeny. Bioinformatics, 17, 754-755.
Irestedt, M., Fjeldså, J., Nylander, J.A.A. \& Ericson, P.G.P. (2004) Phylogenetic relationships of typical antbirds (Thamnophilidae) and test of incongruence based on Bayes factors. BMC Evolutionary Biology, 4, 23.
Isler, M.L., Lacerda, D.R., Isler, P.R., Hackett, S.J., Rosenberg, K.V. \& Brumfield, R.T. (2006) Epinecrophylla, a new genus of antwrens (Aves: Passeriformes: Thamnophilidae). Proceedings of the Biological Society of Washington, 119, 522-527.
Katoh, K., Misawa, K., Kuma, K-I. \& Miyata, T. (2002) MAFFT: a novel method for rapid multiple sequence alignment based on fast Fourier transform. Nucleic Acids Research, 30, 3059-3066.
Kumar, S., Skjæveland, Å., Orr, R.J.S., Enger, P., Ruden, T., Mevik, B-H., Burki, F., Botnen, A. \& Shalchian-Tabrizi, K. (2009) AIR: A batch-oriented web program package for construction of supermatrices ready for phylogenomic analyses. BMC Bioinformatics 2009, 10, 357.
Lewis, P.O. (2001) A likelihood approach to estimating phylogeny from discrete morphological character data. Systematic Biology, 50, 913-925.
Maddison, W.P. \& Maddison, D.R. (2000) MacClade 4.0. Sinauer Associates, Sunderland, 492p.
Maddison, W.P. \& Maddison, D.R. (2011) Mesquite: a modular system for evolutionary analysis. Version 2.75. Available from $\mathrm{http}: / /$ mesquiteproject.org (accessed 17 October 2011).
Meyer de Schauensee, R. (1966) The species of birds of South America and their distribution. Livingston Publishing Co. Narberth, Pennsylvania, 578 pp.
Miller, M.A., Pfeiffer, W. \& Schwartz, T. (2010) Creating the CIPRES Science Gateway for Inference of Large Phylogenetic Trees. In: Proceedings of the Gateway Computer Environments Workshop, New Orleans, LA, pp. 1-8.
Moyle, R.G., Chesser, R.T., Brumfield, R.T., Tello, J.G., Marchese, D.J. \& Cracraft, J. (2009) Phylogeny and phylogenetic classification of the antbirds, ovenbirds, woodcreepers, and allies (Aves: Passeriformes: infraorder Furnariides). Cladistics, 25, 1-20.
Munn, C.A. \& Terborgh, J.W. (1979) Multi-species territoriality in Neotropical foraging flocks. The Condor, 81, 338-347.
Nylander, J.A.A. (2004) MrModeltest version 2. Evolutionary Biology Center, Uppsala University, Uppsala, Sweden. Available from http://www.abc.se/~nylander/ (accessed 27 August 2011).
Nylander, J.A.A., Wilgenbusch, J.C., Warren, D.L. \& Swofford, D.L. (2008) AWTY (are we there yet?): a system for graphical exploration of mcmc convergence in Bayesian phylogenetics. Bioinformatics, 24, 581-583.
Pearson, D.L. (1977) Ecological relationships of small antbirds in Amazonian bird communities. The Auk, 94, 283-292.
Peters, J.L. (1951) Check-list of the birds of the world: vol. VII. Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, 318 pp.
Prum, R.O. (1990) A test of the monophyly of the manakins (Pipridae) and of the cotingas (Cotingidae) based on morphology. Occasional Papers of the Museum of Zoology, University of Michigan, 723, 1-44.
R Development Core Team. (2011) R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna. Available from http://www.R-project.org (accessed 27 August 2011).
Ridgley, R.S. \& Tudor, G. (1994) The birds of South America. Vol. II. The Suboscine Passerines. University of Texas Press, Austin, 814 pp.
Sclater, P.L. (1858) Synopsis of the American antbirds (Formicariidae). Part II., containing the Formicivorinae or ant-wrens. Proceedings of the Zoological Society of London, 26, 232-272.
Sibley, C. G., \& Monroe, B.L. Jr. (1990) Distribution and taxonomy of birds of the World. Yale University Press. New Haven, Connecticut, 1117 pp .
Sick, H. (1997) Ornitologia brasileira. Editora Nova Fronteira, Rio de Janeiro, 862 pp.
Skutch, A.F. (1946) Life histories of two Panamanian antbirds. The Condor, 48, 16-28.
Skutch, A.F. (1969) Life histories of Central American birds, part III. Pacific Coast Avifauna, 35, 7-550.
Spix, J.B.V. (1825) Avium species novae, quas in itinere per Brasiliam annis MDCCCXVII- MDCCCXX jussu et auspiciis Maximiliani Josephi I Bavariae Regis suscepto collegit et descripsit. Tomo II. Typis Francisci Seraphi Hybschmanni, Munich, 85 pp.
Stamatakis, A. (2006) RAxML-VI-HPC: maximum likelihood-based phylogenetic analyses with thousands of taxa and mixed models. Bioinformatics, 22, 2688-2690.
Stotz, D.F. (1990) Foraging behavior and morphology in the avian genus Myrmotherula. PhD dissertation. University of Chicago, Illinois, 258 pp .
Stotz, D.F., Fitzpatrick, J.W., Parker III, T.A. \& Moskovits, D.K. (1996) Neotropical birds: Ecology and conservation. University of Chicago Press, Chicago and London, 469 pp .
Swofford, D.L. (2003) PAUP*. Phylogenetic analysis using parsimony (*and other methods). Sunderland, Sinauer Associates, CD-ROM.
Swofford, D.L. \& Maddison, W.P. (1987) Reconstructing ancestral character states under Wagner parsimony. Mathematical Biosciences, 87, 199-229.
Whitney, B.M. (1994) Behavior, vocalizations, and possible relationships of four Myrmotherula antwrens (Formicariidae) from eastern Ecuador. The Auk, 111, 469-475.
Wilgenbusch, J.C., Warren, D.L. \& Swofford, D.L. (2004) AWTY: A system for graphical exploration of MCMC convergence in Bayesian phylogenetic inference. Available from http://ceb.csit.fsu.edu/awty (accessed 27 August 2011).
Zimmer, K.J. \& Isler, M.L. (2003) Family Thamnophilidae (Typical Antbirds). In: Del Hoyo, J.; Elliot, A. \& Christie, D.A. (Eds.), Handbook of the Birds of the World, Vol. 8. Broadbills to Tapaculos. Lynx Edicions, Barcelona, pp. 448-681.

## APPENDIX 1.

List of measured specimens and voucher numbers. Skin collections: Louisiana State University Museum of Natural Science-LSUMZ; Museu de Zoologia da Universidade de São Paulo-MZUSP; Museu Paraense Emílio Goeldi-MPEG.

Cymbilaimus lineatus (LSUMZ 67236; 164137; 109816; 119691); Hypoedaleus guttatus (LSUMZ 69110; 101779; MZUSP 6359; 28289); Batara cinerea (LSUMZ 68019; 68255; 153725; MZUSP 34022); Mackenziaena leachii (LSUMZ 62957; MZUSP 31034; 34351; 36446); Mackenziaena severa (LSUMZ 71406; MZUSP 24126; 70194; 75666); Frederickena fulva (LSUMZ 70899; 109823; 115168); Frederickena viridis (LSUMZ 165707; 178432; MPEG 59490; 65409); Taraba major (LSUMZ 124101; 124106; 156455; 177725); Thamnophilus ruficapillus (LSUMZ 65169; 98320; 169877; MPEG 27603); Thamnophilus palliatus (LSUMZ 37679; 162662; 179658; MPEG 60367); Thamnophilus ambiguus (LSUMZ 70441; MZUSP 2838; 28281; 28284); Thamnophilus caerulescens (LSUMZ 74065; 124145; MPEG 47255; 87013); Thamnophilus doliatus (LSUMZ 11403; 116220; 124115; 127131; 175398; 178080); Dysithamnus plumbeus (MZUSP 25086; 33379; 34538; 37863); Dysithamnus mentalis (LSUMZ 27196; 92348; 104686; 128508; 175404; 179012; MZUSP 75515); Herpsilochmus atricapillus (LSUMZ 124185; MZUSP 31766; 83300; 84393); Herpsilochmus rufimarginatus (LSUMZ 68025; 153373; MZUSP 25652; 73351; 76222); Herpsilochmus sticturus (LSUMZ 128512; MPEG 64995; 64996; 65432); Myrmotherula gularis (LSUMZ 52761; MZUSP 81160; 81489; 81490); Dichrozona cincta (LSUMZ 115337; 132757; MPEG 52512; 52861); Isleria hauxwelli (LSUMZ 84823; 109924; 109926; 161753); Megastictus margaritatus (LSUMZ 109854; 115200; 115202; 115203); Thamnomanes caesius (LSUMZ 109866; 109882; 153350; 153352).
Appendix 2. Specimens examined for morphology of the Musculus vocalis ventralis. Source column indicates literature reference or voucher
number from examined specimens. When more than one uncatalogued specimen was examined the number of individuals is indicated in parenthesis. Museum Collections: LSUMZ - Louisiana State University Museum of Natural Science; MCP - Coleção de Ornitologia do Museu de Ciências e Tecnologia da Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio Grande do Sul; MHNCI - Museu de História Natural "Capão da Imbuia"; MZUSP - Museu de Zoologia da Universidade de São Paulo; MPEG - Museu Paraense Emílio Goeldi.

| Species | Source | Country and political subregion | Musculi vocales <br> ventrales |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  |  | separated |
| continuous |  |  |  |


| Species | Source | Country and political subregion | Musculi vocales ventrales |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | separated | continuous |
| Megastictus margaritatus | LSUMZ 114428 | Peru: Loreto | x |  |
| Dysithamnus stictothorax | MCP 3149 | Brazil: Paraná |  | x |
| Dysithamnus mentalis | MCP 2577 | Brazil: Santa Catarina |  | x |
| Dysithamnus xanthopterus | MCP 3164 | Brazil: Paraná |  | x |
| Dysithamnus plumbeus | MCP 3131, MCP 3132 | Brazil: Bahia |  | x |
| Isleria hauxwelli | LSUMZ 117911 | Ecuador: Pastaza |  | x |
| Pygiptila stellaris | MCP 2148 | Brazil: Rondônia | x |  |
| Epinecrophylla spodionota | LSUMZ 83751 | Peru: San Martín | x |  |
| Myrmotherula brachyura | Gonzaga (2001) | Brazil: Roraima | x |  |
| Myrmotherula gularis | MCP 1724, MCP 1725, MCP 1726, MCP 1727, Gonzaga (2001) | Brazil: Bahia, Rio de Janeiro, Paraná |  | x |
| Myrmotherula axillaris | MCP 3134, МСР 3139 , МСР <br> 3159, Gonzaga (2001) | Brazil: Rondônia, Maranhão, Bahia, Rio de Janeiro | x |  |
| Myrmotherula minor | MCP 3155 | Brazil: Bahia | x |  |
| Myrmotherula longipennis | Gonzaga (2001) | Brazil: Maranhão | x |  |
| Myrmotherula urosticta | MCP 3153 | Brazil: Bahia | x |  |
| Myrmotherula unicolor | MCP 2506, МCP 3150, MCP uncatalogued | Brazil: Paraná, Santa Catarina | x |  |
| Myrmotherula menetriesii | Gonzaga (2001) | Brazil: Pará, Maranhão | x |  |
| Dichrozona cincta | LSUMZ 114441 | Peru: Loreto | x |  |
| Myrmorchilus strigilatus | MCP 3161 | Brazil: Bahia |  | x |


|  |  |  | Musculi vocales <br> ventrales <br> species |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Source | Country and political subregion |  |  |
| cons |  |  |  |


| Species | Source | Country and political subregion | Musculi vocales <br> ventrales |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
|  |  |  | separated |
| continuous |  |  |  |

State observed in three individuals of Drymophila malura.
${ }^{2}$ State observed in two individuals of Drymophila malura.

